

FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

First Session

REPORT OF THE PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE

Parl. 14 of 2022

Presented to Parliament on

17 November 2022

PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE

Members

Mr Speaker (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin)
Chairman

Mr Chee Hong Tat
Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport

Mr S Iswaran
Minister for Transport and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations

Mr Leong Mun Wai

Mr Ong Ye Kung
Minister for Health

Ms Rahayu Mahzam
Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Law

Ms Hany Soh

Mr Edwin Tong
Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law

CONTENTS

	<i>Pages</i>
Report of the Public Petitions Committee	1 – 4
Appendix I: Petition Presented to Parliament on 1 August 2022	5 – 7
Appendix II: Written Response from the Ministry of National Development on 16 September 2022	8 – 12
Appendix III: Written Response from the Ministry of National Development on 19 October 2022	13 – 16
Appendix IV: Written Response from the Ministry of National Development on 14 November 2022	17 – 38
Appendix V: Minutes of Proceedings	39 – 42

REPORT OF THE PUBLIC PETITIONS COMMITTEE

The Public Petitions Committee appointed pursuant to Standing Order 100(6) has agreed to the following report:

1 The petition of Ms Chua Shanyu, Mr Lim Cheng Kiang and others of like opinion titled “Petition calling for review in SERS and impose a moratorium on SERS pending the findings and recommendation of the review” was presented by Non-Constituency Member Mr Leong Mun Wai to Parliament on 1 August 2022. There were 5 valid signatories to the petition.

2 A copy of the petition (without the accompanying signatory pages) is attached as Appendix I. An abstract of the petition is as follows:

The Petitioners pray for Members to review the Selective En-bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) in its entirety, including (a) a transparent and independent evaluation of reclaimed site and replacement sites, options of compensation and lease buyback scheme for senior residents; (b) making public the intended use of the reclaimed site so as to assess the actual or potential value of the site; (c) giving priority to residents affected by SERS to be relocated within the vicinity of the reclaimed site; (d) waiver of the resale levy and full reimbursement of the stamp and legal fees to affected residents in all future exercise of SERS; (e) an ex-gratia payment to affected residents to help defray renovation costs and for such a sum to be adjusted for inflation and other factors; and (f) a moratorium on the SERS until such a time that a review on SERS is conducted and the findings and recommendations be presented to Parliament for deliberation.

3 Under Standing Order 100(6), the duty of the Committee is to consider all Petitions referred to it, prepare abstracts thereof in such form and manner as shall appear to it best suited to convey to Parliament all requisite information respecting their contents and the signatures attached thereto and to report the same from time to time to Parliament.

4 The Committee noted that the establishment of a Select Committee to formally inquire into a subject matter is through a motion agreed to by Parliament as provided for under Standing Order 101. The Committee further noted that the authority to amend any legislation resides with Parliament.

5 The Committee agreed to submit the petition to the Ministry of National Development (MND) and to request the Ministry to provide a written response.

6 A written response from MND was received on 16 September 2022 and is attached as Appendix II. The Committee considered MND's written response on 28 September 2022 and decided to request a further memorandum from MND. The second written response from MND, attached as Appendix III, was received on 19 October 2022, and considered by the Committee on 31 October 2022. The third written response from MND, attached as Appendix IV, was received on 14 November 2022, and was deliberated by the Committee on 16 November 2022.

7 MND's responses to the Committee's queries are summarised below.

Prayer (a) of the petition to review SERS to include a transparent and independent evaluation of reclaimed site and replacement sites, options of compensation and lease buyback scheme for senior residents.

- a) There is already in place a transparent and independent valuation of the acquired flats which includes the condition of the flats and extent of renovation works. The market compensation is assessed independently by licensed valuers according to well-established property valuation principles. SERS flat owners who disagree with the valuation of their flats can engage their own valuers to provide a valuation of the property. If they remain dissatisfied thereafter, they can lodge an appeal to the Appeals Board under the Land Acquisition Act. The Board will adjudicate on the market value of the acquired flat as a neutral assessor.
- b) There is a wide range of options for rehousing. SERS flat owners can purchase a new flat at a designated replacement site nearby at a subsidised price frozen as at the time of the SERS announcement or apply for a subsidised flat under BTO or Sale of Balance Flats (SBF) with priority or open booking of flats. They will receive a SERS grant of \$30,000. Alternatively, they can sell their SERS flat with rehousing benefits on the open market or opt out of rehousing benefits and receive an ex-gratia payment of \$30,000 on top of compensation.
- c) Additional affordable options, such as the 50-year lease flats and LBS option, have been offered to Ang Mo Kio (AMK) SERS residents pursuant to feedback from residents and the

Member of Parliament (MP) for the area, Ms Nadia Samdin, as announced on 2 July 2022 prior to the presentation of the petition.

- d) With the various rehousing options (including the 50-year lease and LBS) and based on the actual compensations computed, 99% of the AMK SERS flat owners can purchase a new replacement flat of a similar flat type or size, without the need for a cash top-up.

Prayer (b) of the petition to review SERS to make public the intended use of the reclaimed site so as to assess the actual or potential value of the site

- e) The intended use of the reclaimed site for residential use is already in the public domain and has been so since the publication of the Master Plan in 2019.

Prayer (c) of the petition to review SERS to give priority to residents affected by SERS to be relocated within the vicinity of the reclaimed site

- f) AMK SERS residents have been offered new flats at Ang Mo Kio Drive which is close to the SERS site at Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3, allowing the residents to continue living in a familiar environment. Besides buying a new flat at the designated replacement site, SERS flat owners may also choose to apply for a new flat elsewhere under the BTO and SBF exercises, with priority.

Prayer (d) of the petition to review SERS to waive the resale levy and fully reimburse stamp and legal fees to affected residents in all future exercise of SERS

- g) The resale levy is waived for owners of SERS flats, the exception being SERS households who had previously sold a subsidised flat elsewhere and, at that point, opted to pay a resale levy when they buy a second subsidised flat from HDB. In such instances, the resale levy is capped at \$30,000 as a concession under SERS.
- h) On stamp duty and legal fees, SERS flat owners already receive a sum of money to offset the fees that will be incurred for the purchase of a replacement flat equivalent in value to their SERS flat.

Prayer (e) of the petition to review SERS to include an ex-gratia payment to affected residents to help defray renovation costs

- i) While there is no renovation allowance, the cash outlay needed for renovations can be reduced by opting in for fittings and fixtures to be installed in the new flat under the Optional Component Scheme (OCS), which can be paid via CPF monies and/or the housing loan.
- j) There is a removal allowance derived based on what the resident would reasonably incur for removal at today's prices, taking into account actual moving costs.

Prayer (f) of the petition for a moratorium on the SERS until such a time that a review on SERS is conducted and the findings and recommendations be presented to Parliament for deliberation.

- k) The issues raised in the petition have been addressed as part of the existing policy or have been addressed more recently, prior to the presentation of the petition. SERS is highly selective and most of the projects with high redevelopment potential have already been selected. MND does not expect many more sites to be eligible. As such, there is no need for a moratorium or a further review on SERS.

8 The Committee considered the petition and MND's written responses, and agreed to convey the abstracts thereof contained in this report to Parliament.

Petition Presented to Parliament on 1 August 2022

01

Presented by Leong Mun Wai (Non-Constituency Member of the Parliament)

PETITION

To the Honourable Members of the Parliament of the Republic of Singapore, in meeting assembled.

The humble Petition of Chua Shanyu, Lim Cheng Kiang and others of like opinion.

SHOWETH THAT:

Petition calling for review in SERS and impose a moratorium on SERS pending the findings and recommendation of the review

1. To the Honourable the Members of Parliament, Singapore, in the meeting assembled, the undersigned, hereby present this Petition to Parliament for a review on the Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) and a moratorium on SERS pending the findings and recommendation of the review.
2. The Housing Development Board (HDB) announced on 7 April 2022 to take back Blk 562, 563, 564 and 565 in Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 for estate rejuvenations under SERS. An action that will have a devastating impact on the lives of the residents.
3. We understand that our 4 blocks have been chosen for redevelopment via compulsory acquisition and home owners like us have no choice but to participate in SERS. Since the announcement, many residents, including the Pioneer and Merdeka generations have suffered untold stress and anguish from the financial uncertainties brought about by SERS and the unfavourable location of the replacement site at Ang Mo Kio Drive.
4. Most residents of HDB blocks are not property speculators. We have worked hard all our lives and some of us have already paid off the liability of our homes. With what savings we have, we want to enjoy a deserved retirement in a flat size that we have chosen, benefiting from the convenience, affordability and public transport connectivity.
5. Using the current Ang Mo Kio SERS site as an example, it is much better situated, spaced and connected with many amenities in the neighbourhood. It also benefits from its excellent transport links due to the close proximity to AMK MRT and with more than 15 bus routes servicing all regions of Singapore.
6. By being forced to vacate their flats under SERS, residents are deprived of the existing benefits of their current site while the land can be developed by HDB as new HDB flats to be resold at a higher price or be potentially redevelop or sold to private developers that might command a much higher valuation.

7. As a result of the evaluation by HDB of the SERS site and the replacement site, many of the affected residents are expected to pay for shortfalls of sums of tens of thousands, if not hundred. Many residents, particularly seniors, who have paid up for their flats in full, have expressed the inability to afford to pay for their shortfall and express worry for what would happen to their housing arrangements. This issue would surely be further exacerbated when SERS is applied to HDB flats with shorter lease and the current Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise highlights the need to review how SERS compensate the affected residents.
8. We note in the past, SERS residents were given additional options. Tanglin Halt SERS had 5 replacement options and West Coast Road SERS has 2 replacement options. We find it very disappointing and upsetting that we are only offered 1 replacement site on the fringe of Ang Mo Kio with inadequate transportation and accessibility to amenities; while a better and more convenient site at Ang Mo Kio Central will be offered to the public.
9. Again using, the current SERS exercise as an example. The current SERS rehousing option is offering 10% priority allocation for August 2022 Ang Mo Kio BTO launch. This will likely prove to be inadequate given the oversubscription of BTO flats and the overwhelming feedback from residents wanting to stay closer to Ang Mo Kio central due to the similarity in accessibility and connectivity. Many residents have lived their entire lives in the Ang Mo Kio. They have helped build that community and wish to remain centrally part of it. This would reasonably apply to most residents in Singapore.
10. Instead of leaving to chance, residents affected by SERS should be assured that they can continue to live in the district. This is especially so for senior residents who had planned to live out their remaining life in the flat that they have paid fully for.
11. As the residents are forced to purchase a replacement flat under SERS, we feel that HDB should waive off all resale levy, stamp and legal fees in all future SERS exercises instead of applying it on a case-to-case basis.
12. We also ask that the substantial increase in cost of living be taken into consideration. We have had to endure significant inflation; rising interest rate environment and Goods and Service Tax (GST) is due to increase to 9% in 2024. The current SERS grant is insufficient to cover renovation costs and residents are given grants based on marriage status. Singles were told that they will receive a lesser SERS grant amount than units with families. We urge HDB to look into this and provide a realistic ex gratia amount that can help to defray renovation costs for residents affected by SERS. These extra costs borne by the residents are a direct result of SERS which we would not have otherwise incurred.

13. Given the timing of an increasing interest rate environment, it would be difficult for us home owners to bear additional burden. Some of us might not even be eligible to get any loan. The residents are left to suffer from inferior alternatives, or bear the extra costs to achieve the same benefits and conveniences. This is in direct contradiction to the objective of the SERS scheme.
14. We urge HDB to consider the cost of living that has risen over the years even more so recently, the sacrifices that we have to make for the greater good of our neighbours around us who are not affected by SERS and the nation while we are deprived of these convenience and benefits.
15. We hope that HDB can review the current outdated SERS compensation policy and provide a fairer SERS compensation and rehousing options for the residents of the SERS at Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 and those affected in future SERS and that the review be guided by its mission of providing affordable and quality housing for residents as well as the original intentions of SERS.

NOW WE, THE UNDERSIGNED, PRAY that the Honourable Members of Parliament take steps to:

- a) review the Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) in its entirety which include a transparent and independent evaluation of reclaimed site and replacement sites, options of compensation and lease buyback scheme for senior residents.
- b) consider in its review of SERS that the intended use of the reclaimed site be made public so as to assess the actual or potential value of the site.
- c) consider in its review of SERS, the priority of ensuring residents affected by SERS be relocated within the vicinity of the reclaimed site.
- d) consider in its review, that the waiver of the Resale Levy and full reimbursement of stamp and legal fees for the affected residents are applicable in all future exercise of SERS.
- e) consider in its review, an ex-gratia payment to affected residents to help defray renovation costs and for such a sum to be adjusted for inflation and other factors.
- f) consider in its review, a moratorium on SERS until such a time that a review on SERS is conducted and the findings and recommendations be made for the Parliament to be deliberated.

Dated this 22 July 2022

Name: Chua Shanyu

Name: Lim Cheng Kiang

No. of Signatories: 5

The above petition is in accordance with the provisions of the relevant rules in paragraph (5) of Standing Order No. 18 (Petitions).

Clerk of Parliament
Singapore, 26 July 2022

Written Response from the Ministry of National Development on 16 September 2022

We refer to the Committee's request for a written memorandum from MND on the facts, policies and issues raised generally by petitioners, and prayers (a) to (e), as set out in the petition presented to Parliament by Mr Leong Mun Wai on 1 August 2022 with regard to the Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS), specifically for Parliament to:

- (a) Review SERS in its entirety which include a transparent and independent evaluation of reclaimed site and replacement sites, options of compensation and lease buyback scheme for senior residents;
- (b) Consider in its review of SERS that the intended use of the reclaimed site be made public so as to assess the actual or potential value of the site;
- (c) Consider in its review of SERS, the priority of ensuring residents affected by SERS be relocated within the vicinity of the reclaimed site;
- (d) Consider in its review, that the waiver of the resale levy and full reimbursement of stamp and legal fees for the affected residents are applicable in all future exercise of SERS;
- (e) Consider in its review, an ex-gratia payment to affected residents to help defray renovation costs and for such a sum to be adjusted for inflation and other factors; and
- (f) Consider in its review, a moratorium on SERS until such a time that a review on SERS is conducted and the findings and recommendations be made for the Parliament to be deliberated.

Response to Matters Raised in the Petition

(a) Review of SERS, Independent Evaluation, Options for Compensation and Lease Buyback Scheme (LBS) for Senior Residents

SERS Programme

2. Redevelopment is critical in Singapore as it allows us to optimise land use in our land-scarce city-state. SERS was introduced in 1995 as part of our estate renewal strategy for older HDB estates.
3. Under SERS, the Government acquires selected HDB blocks with higher redevelopment potential under the Land Acquisition Act (LAA), and compensates them based on the market value of their flat as at the time of the SERS announcement, in line with the provisions of the LAA. In addition, the government provides the eligible flat owners with SERS rehousing benefits.
4. SERS is highly selective and HDB estimates that only around 5% of all HDB flats are suitable for SERS. Most of the projects with high redevelopment potential have already been selected, and we do not expect many more sites to be eligible. As such, an extensive review of SERS would be unnecessary.

Transparent and Independent Valuation

5. The existing valuation process for flats acquired under SERS is transparent and independent. Flat owners who disagree with the valuation have recourse to neutral adjudication of the same.
6. The market compensation for all SERS flats is assessed independently by licensed private valuers in accordance with well-established property valuation principles. These include taking into consideration factors such as prices of recent transactions of comparable resale flats, the remaining lease duration of the SERS flat, and flat attributes, including the condition and extent of renovation works.
7. Flat owners who disagree with the valuation of their flats are at liberty to engage their own valuers to provide a valuation of the property, and if still dissatisfied thereafter, they can lodge an appeal to the Appeals Board (Land Acquisition), under the LAA. The tribunal will adjudicate on the market value of the acquired flat as a neutral assessor.
8. The pricing of the new replacement flats follows HDB's pricing approach for BTO flats, which includes a significant subsidy off market values. Eligible flat buyers may also qualify for the Enhanced CPF Housing Grant.

Options for compensation/Rehousing options

9. It is not clear what is meant by "options of compensation" in the Petition. As far as compensation is concerned, the relevant compensation for an acquired flat is the market value of the same.
10. If however the petition is referring to rehousing options, then there is a wide array of options SERS flat owners can choose from. For instance, they can purchase a new flat at a designated replacement site nearby at a subsidised price frozen at the time of the SERS announcement, or apply for a subsidised flat under the Build-To-Order (BTO) or Sale of Balance Flats (SBF) exercises with priority, or open booking of flats. Eligible households buying a replacement flat will also receive a SERS grant of up to \$30,000.
11. If they do not wish to take up a replacement flat, they can sell their SERS flat with the rehousing benefits on the open market, or opt out of the rehousing benefits and receive an ex-gratia payment of \$30,000 on top of their compensation. They can then use the proceeds to purchase a resale flat on the open market.
12. Additionally, SERS flat owners will receive payment for reasonable expenses, comprising a removal allowance of \$10,000 and payment for stamp and legal fees for buying a replacement flat equivalent in value to the SERS flat.
13. HDB reviews the entire benefits package of each SERS site holistically to make sure the policies and benefits remain relevant, meet the needs of residents, and take into consideration the prevailing circumstances.
14. In the case of the SERS exercise at Blocks 562-565 Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3, having regard to the concerns of the SERS flat owners especially seniors, HDB provided additional rehousing options:

- (a) Those aged 45 years and above at the point of the SERS announcement (some 540 SERS households), have the option to purchase a new flat at the designated replacement site on a 50-year lease option which will provide them with a home for life, until the age of at least 95. With the 50-year lease option, most SERS flat owners will be able to move to a new replacement flat of similar size with no top-up.
- (b) Seniors aged 65 and above have an additional option of taking up the LBS on their existing flat, and buying a new replacement flat of the same flat type on a short-lease. This allows seniors to monetise their SERS flat and enjoy an LBS cash bonus of up to \$30,000 when they top-up their CPF Retirement Account and participate in CPF LIFE to prepare for their retirement years.

(b) Make public the intended use of reclaimed site to assess the potential value of the site

15. The intended use of the reclaimed site is already publicly known. Government releases information on the intended land use of specific plots through the Master Plan, which guides Singapore's development in the medium term. The SERS site was zoned for residential use in Master Plan 2019.

16. In assessing the market values of the SERS flats, the private licensed valuer will take reference from recent transactions of comparable flats, which would have taken into account all publicly announced plans at the point of valuation, which is pegged to the time of SERS announcement. In the case of the SERS flats at Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3, the surrounding resale flats would have been transacted taking into consideration the construction of the new Tavistock MRT Station announced on 25 January 2019.

(c) Priority for SERS residents to be relocated within the vicinity of the reclaimed site

17. As with all SERS exercises, the replacement site at Ang Mo Kio Drive is close to the SERS site at Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3, and hence allows the residents to continue living in a familiar environment. The replacement site is situated next to ITE College Central, which currently has a supermarket, shops and food & beverage outlets. The site is also a five-minute walk from the Cheng San Neighbourhood Centre, which the SERS residents are familiar with. The neighbourhood centre has a wet market, hawker centre and a wide range of shops to meet their daily needs. In addition, within the replacement site itself, there will be commercial facilities (including an eating house and shops), a childcare centre, a kidney dialysis centre, and a Resident's Network Centre.

18. For SERS exercises where a single replacement site does not yield enough new flats to meet the housing needs, more than one replacement site may be offered. However, the replacement site at Ang Mo Kio Drive will have 1,065 flats, and suffices to house the SERS residents. Hence, similar to 90% of the past SERS exercises, the Ang Mo Kio SERS residents have been offered new flats at one designated replacement site.

19. Besides buying a new flat at the designated replacement site, SERS flat owners also have a range of other rehousing options to choose from. They may choose to buy a new flat elsewhere under the BTO and SBF exercises with priority and the SERS rehousing benefits if the Delivery Possession Date (DPD) of the new flat is no later than that of the new replacement flats. They will be given priority for 10% of the BTO/SBF flat supply, shared with flat applicants under resettlement/clearance,

relocation or other compulsory acquisition projects under the Land Acquisition Act, and the Tenants' Priority Scheme. If they are not balloted within the 10% quota, they will get another chance of balloting together with public applicants. Alternatively, they can choose to buy a resale flat from the open market and receive an ex-gratia sum of \$30,000 plus SERS grant (if eligible) or sell the SERS flat with rehousing benefits.

20. For the August 2022 BTO exercise, HDB exercised flexibility to also offer Ang Mo Kio SERS residents the option to apply for a BTO flat at Central Weave @ AMK with their SERS benefits and enjoy 10% priority allocation, though the DPD for Central Weave @ AMK is later than that of the SERS replacement flats. This takes into consideration Ang Mo Kio SERS residents' requests to continue living in a familiar environment, and that its DPD is estimated to be within the same year as the DPD of their designated replacement site. To date, 117 Ang Mo Kio SERS households have applied for a new flat elsewhere under the BTO/SBF exercises in May and August 2022 using their priority and rehousing benefits. Overall, about 9 in 10 applicants fall within the 10% priority allocation quota, which means a vast majority of the Ang Mo Kio SERS households will be successful in their applications.

(d) Resale levy and full reimbursement of stamp and legal fees

Resale Levy

21. Singaporeans are typically allowed to purchase up to two subsidised flats, and are required to pay a resale levy before or upon the purchase of their second subsidised flat. This is to ensure a fairer distribution of public housing subsidies between first-time and second-time buyers of subsidised flats.

22. Under SERS, households whose SERS flat is a subsidised flat do not need to pay a resale levy when they buy a subsidised new replacement flat from HDB. This waiver of resale levy is a concession under SERS. However, the resale levy is payable for SERS households who had previously sold a subsidised flat elsewhere and opted to pay a resale levy when they buy a second subsidised flat from HDB. Nevertheless, in such instances, the resale levy is capped at \$30,000 as a concession under SERS. In addition, SERS flat owners who are liable for but do not wish to pay the resale levy have other housing options, such as selling their SERS flat with the rehousing benefits on the open market or opting for an ex-gratia payment on top of the market compensation for their SERS flat. They can then buy a resale flat of their choice without the need to pay any levy.

Stamp Duty and Legal Fees

23. On top of the resale levy concessions, SERS flat owners receive a sum of money to offset the stamp duty and legal fees for the purchase of a replacement flat equivalent in value to their SERS flat. This is a fair and equitable approach as otherwise, those who buy higher priced replacement housing will receive more while those who opt for lower priced replacement housing would receive less.

(e) Ex-gratia payment to affected residents to help defray renovation costs

24. HDB reviews the entire benefits package holistically for each SERS site. In reviewing the removal allowance, we consider factors such as the cost of engaging movers, which is typically between \$300 and \$500 per truck load.

25. To minimise the need for renovations, SERS flat owners can opt in for fittings and fixtures to be installed in their new flat under the Optional Component Scheme (OCS). The cost of the OCS will be incorporated into the flat price, which can be paid via CPF monies and/or the housing loan, thus reducing the cash outlay needed for renovations.

26. We continue to monitor the costs closely and will review the SERS benefits package as and when needed.

Summary

27. Singapore’s land scarcity makes it critical for us to be able to recycle land, and to continuously redevelop and renew ourselves. We need to free up land that can be intensified and optimised for various uses, including public housing for younger generations who want to set up their families. In the case of SERS, we identify land which we can intensify early, and compensate flat owners for their existing flats at market value in accordance with the Land Acquisition Act, alongside rehousing benefits and grants to share the gains of early redevelopment with the residents.

ANNEX: Timeline of Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 SERS-related announcements

Date	Description
7 April 2022	Announcement of SERS exercise at Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 Blks 562-565
2 July 2022	MND announced two additional rehousing options: (i) option for SERS flat owners to purchase a three-room or larger new replacement flat (up to the same flat type as the SERS flat) on a 50-year lease and (ii) the option for seniors to take up the Lease Buyback Scheme (LBS) on their existing flats even though SERS had been announced and purchase a short-lease new replacement flat.
4 July 2022	<p>In response to the Adjournment Motion “Ensuring Equitable Outcomes in Housing Redevelopment” by Member of Parliament (MP) Ms Nadia Ahmad Samdin, Minister for National Development Desmond Lee explained both the SERS programme in general and the new rehousing options in detail.</p> <p>Parliamentary Questions (PQ) for oral answer on 4 July on the Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise, including questions on rehousing options, were effectively addressed by Minister (ND) in his response to the AM. We understand that MPs who had filed oral PQs for answer on 4 July on this topic did not roll over their questions to the sitting on 5 July though they could have done so. Consequently, Written Answers were issued to the same under the Standing Orders, in addition to the answers provided by the Minister in his response to the Adjournment Motion.</p>

Written Response from the Ministry of National Development on 19 October 2022

We refer to the Committee's request for a further written memorandum from MND on the following matters in respect of the Ang Mo Kio (AMK) Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) exercise:

- (1) Whether this is the first-time SERS residents are required to top-up?
- (2) HDB had on 7 April 2022 informed AMK SERS residents of the compensation package despite knowing top-ups may be needed but did not offer the 50-year lease and only did so about three months later. Why so?
- (3) Can MND clarify whether there were any significant changes in the design of the AMK SERS package due to the valuation approach or the change in external environment and/or any other reasons.
- (4) If indeed the AMK SERS is significantly different, whether MND will look into what are the principles and parameters for valuation of the SERS and new replacement flats.
- (5) For SERS, other than reducing the lease and the other steps that are already set out in the memorandum of 16 September 2022, what other measures will MND consider to lighten the burden (for example, if there is a top-up) on SERS residents having to move from one place to another. For example, whether there will be a review of the ex-gratia payment.

Response to Matters Raised

(1) Whether this is the first-time SERS residents are required to top-up

2. The compensation for the acquired SERS flats and the selling prices of the new replacement flats are both determined based on the prevailing market values of each respectively, taken at the time of SERS announcement. The valuations take into account a number of factors, the key ones being site location, remaining lease length, flat types and sizes. The selling price of the new replacement flats will also include a significant subsidy.

3. Following the announcement of a SERS exercise, HDB will share with the SERS residents initial estimates of the compensation and selling prices of the replacement flats to provide them with *preliminary* information to facilitate their decision-making on rehousing options.

4. The finalised valuations of the compensation are typically provided about eight months after announcement as the private licensed valuer will have to make individual appointments with each household to inspect and assess the market value of each flat, taking into consideration the specific attributes of the individual units, for example, the extent of renovations.

5. Whether or not top-ups are needed will depend on the residents' rehousing choice, e.g. whether they decide to right-size, move laterally, upgrade to a larger flat, or move to another location. If the selling price of the replacement flat is higher than the market value of the acquired flat, after taking into account housing subsidies and additional grants such as SERS grant and Enhanced CPF Housing Grant (if eligible), then a top-up is required as the SERS resident will be getting a replacement flat with a higher value than the acquired flat.

6. This approach has been consistently applied since the inception of SERS in 1995.

7. There have in the past been instances of residents topping up to purchase the new flats where the selling price were higher than the compensation for the acquired flats (e.g. due to more central location, larger flat etc.). Hence this is not the first time SERS residents have topped up.

8. In the case of the Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise, however, a significant number of flat owners are expected to top up if they wish to buy a flat of similar size on a 99-year lease at the replacement site, because the remaining lease of their acquired flats is only 57 years as at the time of the SERS announcement, which is almost half that of a fresh 99-year lease when they move out in 2027. Assuming the SERS residents opt for a new replacement flat of similar size, they would be exchanging an older flat with only 57 years left to run with a new flat on a full 99 years of leasehold and this is reflected in the differential in value.

(2) Timing of the 50-year lease option, which was offered three months after SERS announcement

9. MND/HDB's approach is to ensure that SERS residents have access to a range of affordable rehousing options. Based on HDB's initial estimates, most residents would not have to top-up to move to a replacement flat of the same flat type (i.e. 3-room for 3-room, 4-room for 4-room), albeit of a smaller size, on a fresh 99-year lease.

10. Following the SERS announcement in April 2022, HDB SERS Journey Managers carried out one-to-one engagements with the residents to provide them with personalised advice on the SERS process and their rehousing options, as well as to gather their feedback. That was when many senior residents gave feedback to HDB that they would prefer to move into a replacement flat of the same size, but they did not need a fresh 99-year lease. They were also concerned that they might not have enough cash to top up if they were to buy a new flat of a similar size on a 99-year lease.

11. HDB also received similar feedback from the local MP Ms Nadia Samdin who appealed on behalf of her residents for additional options to be made available to these SERS residents.

12. HDB was responsive to the residents' feedback and concerns, and therefore offered additional options in July 2022 to better meet the needs of the flat owners, especially the seniors, who had expressed a clear preference for a replacement flat that was similar in size to their current flat, and in familiar surroundings, but felt that they did not require a fresh 99-year lease for their new flat.

13. HDB therefore offered the following additional options in July 2022 to allow:

- (a) SERS flat owners to buy a 3-room or larger new replacement flat on a 50-year lease (up to the same flat type as the acquired SERS flat); and
- (b) seniors to take up the Lease Buyback Scheme (LBS) on their existing flats and purchase a short-lease new replacement flat.

(3) and (4) Design of the AMK SERS package in relation to the valuation approach and external environment, and if there are significant differences

14. We will answer the Committee's Questions (3) and (4) together.

15. There has been no change in the design of the AMK SERS package and the basis of the valuation approach. The valuation approach and principles are consistent across all SERS exercises. As explained in the previous written response, compensation is pegged to the prevailing market value of the SERS flat as at the date of announcement, in line with the Land Acquisition Act (LAA). The valuation process for flats acquired under SERS is transparent and performed independently by private licensed valuers, and flat owners who disagree with the given valuation have recourse to neutral adjudication.

16. When pricing the replacement flats, HDB first establishes their market value by considering the prices of comparable resale flats nearby as well as the individual attributes of the flats and prevailing market conditions, taken as at the time of the SERS announcement. To derive the selling prices, HDB applies a significant subsidy to the assessed market values to ensure affordability.

17. The valuation for SERS compensation is based on well-established property valuation principles¹ and in accordance with the LAA². The valuation approach for the Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise does not depart from these.

18. The only difference between the Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise and previous SERS exercises is that in the case of the Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise the additional options of the 50-year lease and LBS options were offered for the reasons stated above. Even then, the new replacement flats with the shorter 50-year leases and the short-lease replacement flats under the LBS are valued according to the same valuation approach and principles mentioned above, taking into account the length of the lease and the accompanying conditions under LBS (e.g. no resale or renting out on the open market).

19. Like all past SERS exercises, HDB reviewed the entire benefits package ahead of the SERS exercise at Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 holistically to make sure the policies and benefits remain relevant, meet the needs of residents, and take into consideration the prevailing circumstances and the wider environment.

(5) Further measures for SERS flat owners beyond the current measures

20. With the additional 50-year lease and LBS options announced in Jul 2022, we expect most SERS flat owners to be able to obtain a new replacement flat of similar size without the need for any top-up, due to the shorter tenure of the replacement flat under these options.

¹ In determining the market values of the SERS flats, the private licensed valuers have relied on the Market Comparison Approach. In this approach, sales of comparable flats are used as evidence to assess the market value of a flat. Adjustments are made to account for differences in location, lease duration, orientation, floor level, extent and conditions of renovation, among others.

² Section 33 (1) of The Land Acquisition Act (Chapter 152) provides that compensation shall be determined based on the market value as at the date of gazette which is 7 Apr 2022.

21. For those who do not meet the home-for-life criterion for a 50-year lease flat but are unable to take up a new flat with a full 99-year lease due to extenuating circumstances, we will consider availing them the 50-year lease option on a case-by-case basis.

22. HDB's Journey Managers will continue to provide personalised advice to the SERS flat owners. The ranges of market value provided to the SERS flat owners so far are estimates, to allow the flat owners to do a preliminary assessment of their budget for the replacement flat, so that they have more time to consider their rehousing options. Since announcement of the SERS exercise in April 2022, the private licensed valuer has been making appointments with the SERS flat owners to inspect individual units and factor in the extent and conditions of renovation for the market compensation, and we expect to update the SERS flat owners in November 2022 on the actual compensation amount. Our Journey Managers will continue to keep in close touch with the residents and provide clarifications and support.

Written Response from the Ministry of National Development on 14 November 2022

We refer to the Committee's request for a third written memorandum from MND on the following matters in respect of the Ang Mo Kio (AMK) Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) exercise:

- (1) Whether this (AMK SERS exercise) is the first time in the Information Leaflet for any SERS programme that a top-up is required in the illustration for an equivalent replacement flat-type.

Table below extracted from Information Leaflet for SERS of Blocks 9 to 12, 9A and 12A Ghim Moh Road

- **Buying an Equivalent Replacement Flat-Type**

With the market compensation, generous rehousing benefits and comprehensive financial package, you will generally be able to afford an equivalent replacement flat-type with a net surplus.

Payment/(receipt) by an existing 3-room flat owner buying an equivalent flat-type

Payment/(Receipt)	Flat Type	Existing 3-room (59 m ²) Flat Owner Buying New 3-room (65 m ²)	Existing 3-room (67 m ²) Flat Owner Buying New 3-room (65 m ²)
Estimated Selling Price of New Flat at 10th Storey® (a)		\$148,000	\$148,000
Less: Estimated Compensation* for Existing Flat (b)		\$175,000	\$195,000
Normal Payment / (Receipt) (c) = (a) - (b)		(\$27,000)	(\$47,000)
Less: Discount# (d)		\$29,600	\$29,600
Final Payment**/(Receipt) (e) = (c) - (d)		(\$56,600)	(\$76,600)

- (2) The Committee recognised that a 50-year BTO lease has been offered in response to the feedback from AMK SERS residents and would like to enquire whether the following additional options can be further considered:

- a. Increase the SERS grant which was fixed at \$30,000 per unit since 1995, in line with the increase in HDB BTO prices;
- b. Waive the resale levy for eligible residents because of the compulsory nature of the SERS acquisition; and
- c. Increase the relocation allowance in proportion to the increase in inflation since 1995.

Response to Matters Raised

(1) Whether the Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise is the first time a top-up is indicated in the information leaflet for an equivalent replacement flat type

2. The Ang Mo Kio SERS exercise is not the first time a top-up has been indicated in the information leaflet for an equivalent replacement flat type. In MND's Second Written Response to Public Petitions Committee (PPC) dated 19 October 2022, we had informed the PPC that this is not the first time SERS residents have topped up for a replacement flat (see paragraphs 2 – 8 of the Second Written Response).

3. In the Commonwealth Drive and West Coast Road SERS exercises (announced in 2003 and 2016 respectively), residents who would have to top up to purchase new flats of equivalent type, where the selling price was expected to be higher than the compensation for the acquired flats due to differences in flat attributes, were duly informed of the same in the information leaflet:

- a. For the Commonwealth Drive SERS exercise, 3-Room (52m²) SERS flat owners who chose to buy a larger 60m² replacement 3-Room flat at the replacement site at Tanglin Halt Road were expected to top up around \$5,600. (See Annex A for extract of information leaflet.);
- b. For the West Coast Road SERS exercise, 3-Room (67/68m²) and 4-Room (92m²) SERS flat owners who chose to buy a similar-sized replacement flat at the more centrally located replacement site at Clementi Ave 1 were expected to top up \$7,000 and \$23,000 respectively. On the other hand, SERS residents who chose to buy an equivalent replacement flat at West Coast Crescent were not required to top-up. (See Annex B for extract of information leaflet.)

4. The AMK, Commonwealth Drive and West Coast Road SERS follow the valuation approach which has been consistently applied since the inception of SERS, as explained in the Second Written Response.

5. To update the PPC, on 9 November 2022, HDB shared the finalised valuations for the AMK SERS flats with residents. The actual compensations are, on average, about 7.5% higher than the estimated market values provided at the point of the SERS announcement. With the various rehousing options (including the 50-year lease and Lease Buyback Scheme (LBS)) and based on the actual compensations for the SERS flats at Ang Mo Kio Ave 3, 99% of flat owners can purchase a new replacement flat of a similar flat type or size, without cash top-up, and enjoy the benefits of moving into a new flat with a lease that can last them till the age of 95 and above (see Annex C for media reports).

(2a) Whether SERS Grant can be increased in line with BTO prices

6. The SERS Grant quantum of \$30,000 remains relevant and appropriate today. This is because the SERS Grant is not the only financial support provided to make the replacement flats affordable:

- a. The selling price of the new replacement flats already has a generous subsidy built in, making their prices considerably lower than comparable resale flats;
- b. SERS residents may also choose to apply for the subsidised flats in other Build-to-Order (BTO) or Sale of Balance Flats (SBF) exercises;

c. The 50-year lease option and the LBS on the SERS flat provide alternative affordable options to residents;

d. This was explained in paragraphs 10 – 11 of the First Written Response.

7. The SERS Grant must therefore be seen in context i.e. it provides targeted *additional* assistance for eligible households *over and above* a wide array of other options, all of which are designed to keep the replacement flats affordable, according to the means and needs of the SERS flat owners. As such, there are no plans for an increase in the Grant.

(2b) Whether to waive the Resale Levy because of the compulsory nature of SERS

8. This has previously been addressed in paragraphs 21 – 22 of the First Written Response as well as the answer to PQ 1993 (See Annex D for Written Reply to PQ 1993). The compulsory nature of SERS is already accounted for in the concessions made.

(2c) Whether to increase the removal allowance

9. This has previously been addressed in paragraphs 12 and 24 of the First Written Response as well as in the answer to PQ 1991 and 3198 (See Annexes E and F for Written Replies to respective PQs). The removal allowance is determined by what the SERS flat owner would reasonably incur for removal today, and not by reference to what would have been incurred 27 years ago in 1995. The current removal allowance of \$10,000 remains sufficient to cover moving expenses.

Summary

10. In conclusion, the Ministry's responses to prayers (a) to (f) in the Petition can be summarised as follows:

- a. With regards to prayer (a) of the petition:
 - i. There is already in place a transparent and independent valuation of the acquired flats (which accounts for the condition and extent of renovation works), with a process for adjudication in the event of differing views on the valuation;
 - ii. There is a wide range of options for rehousing;
 - iii. Additional affordable options, such as the 50-year lease flats and LBS option, have been offered to residents pursuant to feedback from residents and the MP for the area, Ms Nadia Samdin, as announced on 2 July 2022 prior to the presentation of the Petition; and
 - iv. With the various rehousing options and based on the actual compensations computed, 99% of the AMK SERS flat owners can purchase a new replacement flat of a similar flat type or size, without the need for a cash top-up.
- b. The intended use of the acquired site is already in the public domain and has been so since the publication of the Master Plan 2019.
- c. Besides buying a new flat at the designated replacement site, SERS flat owners may also choose to apply for a new flat elsewhere under the BTO and SBF exercises, with priority.

- d. With regard to prayer (d):
- i. The resale levy is waived for owners of SERS flats, the exception being SERS households who had previously sold a subsidised flat elsewhere and at that point opted to pay a resale levy when they buy a second subsidised flat from HDB. In such instances, the resale levy is capped at \$30,000 as a concession under SERS.
 - ii. On stamp duty and legal fees, SERS flat owners already receive a sum of money to offset the fees that will be incurred for purchase of a replacement flat equivalent in value to their SERS flat.
- e. We assume the reference to “renovation costs” in para (e) of the petition is actually a reference to the removal allowance. The removal allowance is derived based on what the resident would reasonably incur for removal at today’s prices, taking into account actual moving costs. If, however, it is a reference to renovation, there is no renovation allowance, but the cash outlay needed for renovations can be reduced by opting in for fittings and fixtures to be installed in the new flat under the Optional Component Scheme (OCS), which can be paid via CPF monies and/or the housing loan.
- f. Finally, the prayer for a moratorium on SERS is sought on the premise that the other prayers in the petition are issues pending resolution. However, as explained in the Ministry’s Written Responses, these issues are already addressed as part of the existing policy or have been addressed more recently, prior to the presentation of the petition. Moreover, as mentioned in the First Written Response, most projects with high development potential have already been selected for SERS and we do not expect many more sites to be eligible. As such, there is no necessity for a moratorium or for further review on SERS.

• New Flats

The new replacement flats are conveniently located next to the Commonwealth MRT Station, opposite the Tanglin Halt Neighbourhood Centre that offers a wide range of shopping, eating and marketing facilities. Soaring at 40-storey high, a total of 700 units of Studio Apartments, 3-room, 4-room and 5-room flats from the three new apartment blocks will be offered for selection to eligible flat lessees of Blocks 57, 61, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72 & 73 Commonwealth Drive and Blocks 50, 51, 52, 53 & 54 Tanglin Halt Road.

Replacement Flat type*	Flat Size (m ²)	Estimated Selling Prices
Studio Apartment #	35 m ²	\$ 51,000 - \$ 53,000
Studio Apartment #	45 m ²	\$ 65,000 - \$ 67,000
3-room	60 m ²	\$130,000 - \$136,000
4-room	85 m ²	\$198,000 - \$236,000
4-room	90 m ²	\$207,000 - \$248,000
5-room	110 m ²	\$322,000 - \$373,000

Notes:

- * The allocation of replacement flats is subject to availability and SERS lessees' eligibility.
- # Studio Apartments are offered only to SERS lessees who are at least 55 years old as at the SERS announcement date. They are sold on 30-year leases, with an option to extend for another 10 years. The estimated selling prices indicated in the table are based on 30-year leases. Buyers of SAs (and occupiers aged 55 years and above) are required to top-up their CPF Medisave Account to the prevailing CPF Medisave limit when they surrender their SERS flat.

Examples of how an existing lessee stands to gain from the package

Payment by a 3-room flat lessee (52 m²) to buy a new replacement flat

Payment/(Receipt)	Flat Type	3-room flat (52 m ²) lessees buying					
		SA (35 m ²) ^Δ	SA (45 m ²) ^Δ	3-room (60 m ²)	4-room (85 m ²)	4-room (90 m ²)	5-room (110 m ²)
Estimated Average Selling Price of New Flat *	(a)	\$ 52,000	\$ 66,000	\$132,000	\$218,000	\$229,000	\$355,000
Less Estimated Compensation for Existing Flat	(b)	\$100,000	\$100,000	\$100,000	\$100,000	\$100,000	\$100,000
Normal Payment/(Receipt)	(c) = (a) - (b)	(\$ 48,000)	(\$ 34,000)	\$ 32,000	\$118,000	\$129,000	\$255,000
Less Discount *	(d)	\$ 10,400	\$ 13,200	\$ 26,400	\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000
Final Payment **/(Receipt)	(e) = (c) - (d)	(\$ 58,400)	(\$ 47,200)	\$ 5,600	\$ 88,000	\$ 99,000	\$225,000

Notes:

- * Excludes stamp and conveyancing fees.
- Δ Based on 20% price discount, up to \$30,000, for an eligible family.
- ** Eligible lessees can apply for a mortgage loan from HDB of up to 80% of the net selling price (selling price less discount) of the new flat, subject to full utilisation of CPF monies and credit assessment.
- Δ Buyers of Studio Apartments are required to make full payment upon collection of keys (i.e. no mortgage loan). They are also required to top-up their CPF Medisave Account to the prevailing Medisave limit.

Monthly Instalment Plan

Based on the concessionary interest rate* of 2.6% per annum (from January 2003 to March 2003) and subject to periodic review.

Loan** (Examples)	Repayment Period [#]			
	15 Years	20 Years	25 Years	30 Years
\$ 5,600	\$ 38	\$ 30	\$ 26	\$ 23
\$ 88,000	\$ 591	\$ 471	\$ 400	\$353
\$ 99,000	\$ 665	\$ 530	\$ 450	\$397
\$225,000	\$1,511	\$1,204	\$1,021	\$901

Notes:

- * Apply to eligible SERS lessees only. The concessionary interest rate is pegged at 0.1% point above the CPF Ordinary Account interest rate, revised quarterly each year.
- ** Subject to credit assessment.
- # The repayment period is based on 65 years less the age of the youngest applicant or 30 years, whichever is shorter.

Generally, the compensation for your flat should be enough to pay for a new flat of the same type on a similar storey height and in the same location. You will usually have to top up in cash or CPF if you buy a bigger type of flat.

Example of a 3-room flat owner buying a 3-room flat

Internal floor area of existing flat	67 or 68 m ²		82 or 84 m ²	
Estimated market value of flat on the 6 th storey	\$300,000		\$360,000	
	Site A	Site B	Site A	Site B
Internal floor area of new flat	68 m ²	68 m ²	68 m ²	68 m ²
Estimated subsidised selling price of new flat on the 6 th storey after \$30,000 SERS grant	\$307,000	\$249,000	\$307,000	\$249,000
Remaining cash and/or CPF	-\$7,000	\$51,000	\$53,000	\$111,000

Example of a 4-room flat owner buying a 4-room flat

Internal floor area of existing flat	92 m ²		92 m ²	
Estimated market value of flat on the 6 th storey	\$435,000		\$435,000	
	Site A	Site B	Site A	Site B
Internal floor area of new flat	83 m ²	83 m ²	92 m ²	92 m ²
Estimated subsidised selling price of new flat on the 6 th storey after \$30,000 SERS grant	\$409,000	\$327,000	\$458,000	\$374,000
Remaining cash and/or CPF	\$26,000	\$108,000	-\$23,000	\$61,000

These are examples only. We assume you will use all your CPF refund to buy the new flat, you are eligible for a SERS grant of \$30,000 and there is no outstanding housing loan for your flat. Your actual position will depend on your financial circumstances.

Actual compensation for Ang Mo Kio SERS residents about 7.5% higher than expected: HDB

09 Nov 2022 10:02PM (Updated: 09 Nov 2022 10:02PM)

SINGAPORE: The actual compensation for Ang Mo Kio residents identified for the Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) is about 7.5 per cent higher than expected, the Housing and Development Board (HDB) said on Wednesday (Nov 9).

Close to 90 per cent of SERS households have also been successful in applying for a new flat with their SERS rehousing benefits, HDB said in a media statement.

The higher actual compensations rates are largely caused by two factors. First, the conditions and extent of renovations, fittings and fixtures of flats after a physical inspection. HDB said that flats which are well-renovated and well-maintained command higher market values.

Second, the 7.5 per cent difference also reflects resale market movements between the time the estimates were prepared in February 2022 and the SERS announcement in April 2022.

The flat owners will be compensated for their flats based on the prevailing market value at the time of the SERS announcement, in line with the Land Acquisition Act, HDB said.

Market compensations are assessed by a professional private valuer, taking into account the transacted prices of comparable resale flats in the vicinity, the flats' remaining lease and the individual attributes of the unit, including floor area and storey height.

"The valuation also factored in amenities in the vicinity, both existing and future plans which are already public information, including retail facilities, market, parks, schools, and proximity to MRT station," said HDB.

"The overall assessment of all the contributing factors determined the market value of each flat as at the time of the SERS announcement."

These valuation principles are well-established and have been consistently applied in all the past SERS exercises, HDB added.

On top of market value compensation, affected flat owners will also receive payment for reasonable expenses, comprising a removal allowance of S\$10,000 to defray relocation costs

and stamp and legal fees for the purchase of a replacement flat equivalent in value to their SERS flat.

Eligible flat owners will also receive a SERS grant of up to S\$30,000 for the purchase of a replacement flat.

Flat Type	Estimated Compensation (Market Value)	Actual Compensation (Market Value)	Reasonable Expenses*	Overall Compensation (Actual Compensation + Reasonable Expenses)
3-room flats (68 sqm)	\$290,000 - \$340,000	\$315,000 - \$370,000	\$14,800 - \$16,000	\$329,800 - \$386,000
3-room flats (82 sqm)	\$340,000 - \$390,000	\$381,000 - \$457,000	\$16,400 - \$18,700	\$397,400 - \$475,700
4-room flats (92/93 sqm)	\$380,000 - \$450,000	\$410,000 - \$479,000	\$17,300 - \$19,400	\$427,300 - \$498,400

* Includes a \$10,000 removal allowance and stamp and legal fees for buying a replacement flat equivalent in value to that of SERS flat.

A table showing the compensation amounts for Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 SERS flat owners. (Graphic: HDB)

REHOUSING OPTIONS AT ANG MO KIO DRIVE

At the designated replacement site for SERS flat owners at Ang Mo Kio Drive, a range of options are available, said HDB.

Residents can opt for a new flat on a fresh 99-year lease, which is nearly double the lease of their existing flats by the estimated time of moving out in 2027.

Flat owners aged 55 and above can also take up a new 2-room Flexi flat on a short lease.

Residents can also opt for a 3-room or larger new flat on a 50-year lease, if the 50-year lease is able to last the youngest flat owner until at least age 95.

Flat owners who are at least 65-years-old can also choose to take up the Lease Buyback Scheme for their existing flat and buy a short-lease new replacement flat thereafter.

The latter two rehousing options were introduced in July 2022, HDB said.

With the higher actual compensation payouts, 99 per cent of flat owners can purchase a new replacement flat of a similar flat type or size without cash top-up, said HDB.

OTHER REHOUSING OPTIONS

SERS flat owners who wish to move outside of the designated replacement site at Ang Mo Kio Drive will also have options, HDB said.

They can use their SERS rehousing benefits to buy a new flat elsewhere in HDB's Build-To-Order (BTO) and Sale of Balance Flats (SBF) exercises, receiving priority allocation of 10 per cent of the flat supply where eligible.

They can also buy a flat from HDB's open booking of flats or buy a resale flat from the open market using either the SERS compensation amount and an ex-gratia payment of S\$30,000 plus the SERS grant or the proceeds from the sale of their SERS flat with its rehousing benefits.

In September 2022, HDB said that nearly [one in five](#), or 117 out of 606 households, have applied for a flat in either the May or August 2022 BTO and SBF exercises.

Of those household applicants, 104 received a queue number to book a flat.

"This means that close to 90 per cent of the households have been successful in their flat application," HDB said, adding that the remaining applications exceeded the number of units set aside under the 10 per cent priority allocation quota.

	May 2022 Sales Exercise		August 2022 Sales Exercise	Total
	No. of SERS flat owners who applied for a BTO flat	No. of SERS flat owners who applied for a SBF flat	No. of SERS flat owners who applied for a BTO flat	
Successful in getting a queue no.	13 (100%)	7 (70%)	84 (89%)	104 (~89%)
Not successful in getting a queue no.	-	3	10	13
Total	23		94	117

A table showing the number of SERS households successful in their flat application in the sales exercises. (Graphic: HDB)

In total, 97 SERS households will be able to select new flats at Kim Keat Heights, Lakeside View and Yishun Beacon from the May 2022 BTO sales exercise, as well as Central Weave@AMK, Woodlands South Plains and Sun Plaza Spring from the August 2022 BTO sales exercise.

Seven other SERS households will be selecting flats from the May 2022 SBF sales exercise in towns including Bishan, Sengkang, Tampines and Yishun.

"SERS households who are not successful in the ballot can still apply for new flats elsewhere in subsequent BTO and SBF exercises or open booking with their rehousing benefits," said HDB.

"They also have the option of taking up a new flat at their respective designated site or buy a resale flat thereafter, where they can choose from a wide variety of locations, prices and lease lengths."

HDB officers went door-to-door to deliver compensation notices to flat owners in the four affected SERS blocks on Wednesday.

When serving the compensation notices, the officers also went through a customised financial plan to guide them in choosing a rehousing option that best meets their needs and budget, said HDB.

"With the actual compensation details, the flat owners now will have more clarity and greater certainty in deciding their rehousing options."

HDB said that the registration for the new flats at Ang Mo Kio Drive will start in the first quarter of 2023, with flat owners invited to book their new homes from late 2023.

The actual selling prices of the new flats will be made known by then.

"HDB will continue to provide personalised support for all SERS households and guide them through the entire SERS process," the board added.

SERS, introduced in 1995, is part of the Government's efforts to renew older housing estates. Under the scheme, residents are offered new homes nearby, while the old site will be redeveloped.

The Ang Mo Kio SERS project was the first such announcement in nearly four years.

Before this, the last SERS project was in MacPherson, announced on May 31, 2018.

Source: <https://www.channelnewsasia.com/singapore/ang-mo-kio-sers-actual-compensation-higher-expected-hdb-3057576>

Ang Mo Kio Sers residents to get compensation from HDB that is about 7.5% higher than estimates



[Michelle Ng](#)

Housing Correspondent

PUBLISHED

NOV 9, 2022, 8:30 PM SGT

SINGAPORE - The 606 Ang Mo Kio households whose flats were [picked for the Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme \(Sers\)](#) will receive compensation that is about 7.5 per cent higher than previous estimates, due to resale market movements and their flat condition.

In a statement on Wednesday, the Housing Board said its officers went door to door to deliver compensation notices to flat owners living in Blocks 562 to 565 in Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3.

HDB previously estimated the compensation amount for owners of three-room flats – whose units are 68 sq m or 82 sq m – to range from \$290,000 to \$390,000. Four-room flat owners – whose units are 92 sq m to 93 sq m in size – were estimated to get \$380,000 to \$450,000. These four blocks were completed in 1979 and are about 43 years old.

HDB cited two main factors for the higher actual compensation that residents will receive. First, the actual compensations reflect resale market movements between the time the estimates were prepared in February and the announcement in April.

The Board also said flats that are well maintained will generally command higher market prices.

In response to queries, HDB said it was unable to factor in market movements from February to April as the estimates were prepared ahead of the April 7 announcement.

“The valuer is, however, able to do so using the resale transactions up to the Sers announcement date, hence the higher valuation compared with earlier estimates,” HDB said, adding that its appointed private valuer SRE Global conducted valuations according to established valuation principles and market practices.

Residents can opt for new replacement flats with a fresh 99-year lease in Ang Mo Kio Drive, next to ITE College Central, which have estimated selling prices that range from \$438,000 to \$563,000 for a 90 sq m four-room flat, and \$396,000 to 487,000 for an 80 sq m four-room flat. New three-room flats, which are 65 sq m, are estimated to sell for \$292,000 to \$384,000.

HDB said the actual selling prices of the new replacement flats will be made known during flat selection in late 2023.

Under Sers, owners are compensated for their existing flats based on their flats’ prevailing market value at the time of the Sers announcement.

The Ang Mo Kio site came into the spotlight when some residents, upon comparing their estimated compensation amount and the selling price of similar-sized replacement flats, [were upset at having to fork out more money.](#)

In response to their concerns, HDB announced two new rehousing options.

First, a shorter 50-year lease, which makes the replacement flats more affordable. Second, seniors could take up the lease buyback scheme for their existing flats and buy a short-lease replacement flat after.

With these additional options, and based on the actual compensation amounts, HDB said 99 per cent of affected owners can buy a new replacement flat of a similar flat type or size with no cash top-up, with a lease that will cover them till the age of 95 and above.

Compensation amounts for Ang Mo Kio Ave 3 Sers flat owners

Table with 5 columns and 4 rows. Currently displaying rows 1 to 4.

Flat type	Estimated compensation (market value)	Actual compensation (market value)	Reasonable expenses*	Overall compensation (actual compensation + reasonable expenses)
3-room flats (68 sq m)	\$290,000 -	\$315,000 -	\$14,800 -	\$329,800 -
	\$340,000	\$370,000	\$16,000	\$386,000
3-room flats (82 sq m)	\$340,000 -	\$381,000 -	\$16,400 -	\$397,400 -
	\$390,000	\$457,000	\$18,700	\$475,700
4-room flats (92/93 sq m)	\$380,000 -	\$410,000 -	\$17,300 -	\$427,300 -
	\$450,000	\$479,000	\$19,400	\$498,400

*Includes a \$10,000 removal allowance and stamp and legal fees for buying a replacement flat equivalent in value to that of Sers flat.

Affected residents were also able to apply for a new flat in Ang Mo Kio under a priority scheme in the August Build-To-Order (BTO) sales exercise.

About 20 per cent – or 117 out of 606 – of affected residents applied for new flats in the May or August sales exercise. Of these, 104 – or close to 90 per cent – have been successful, said HDB.

Registration for the new replacement flats will start in the first quarter of 2023, and owners will be invited to book a unit in late 2023.

Asked if the actual price of replacement flats may be higher than the estimates, HDB said the selling prices of the new flats are pegged to the time of the announcement, and will not be affected by further market fluctuations.

All 12 residents ST spoke to on Wednesday night said their actual compensation amount is higher than the previous estimates, but only one expressed satisfaction.

Mr Camel Leo, 71, who works as a part-time flyer distributor, said his first reaction when he saw his actual compensation amount was disappointment. He will receive \$351,000 for his three-room flat, an increase of \$11,000 from his estimated compensation amount.

“\$11,000 is nothing, especially when we have to count in renovation costs. I had hoped we could get closer to \$400,000 because as semi-retirees, every dollar is important,” he said.

Estimated prices of replacement flats

Table with 3 columns and 5 rows. Currently displaying rows 1 to 5.

Flat type	New flats at Ang Mo Kio Drive (Internal floor area ¹)	Prices of resale flats nearby ² (Floor area ³)
2-room flexi	\$169,000 - \$247,000 (36 sq m - 46 sq m)	Not available
3-room	\$292,000 - \$384,000 (65 sq m)	Not available
4-room	\$396,000 - \$487,000 (80 sq m)	\$507,999 to \$670,000 (85 - 90 sq m)
4-room	\$438,000 - \$563,000 (90 sq m)	\$507,999 to \$670,000 (85 - 90 sq m)

¹ Refers to the estimated area of the flat computed based on the centre line of the apartment wall. The area of the air-conditioner ledge is excluded for this computation.

² The remaining leases for 4-room resale comparable units are about 80 years. The difference in attributes between the resale comparable units and the new replacement flats should be taken into account when making a comparison.

³ The approximate floor area includes any recess area purchased, space-adding item under HDB’s upgrading programmes, roof terrace, etc.

Table: STRAITS TIMES GRAPHICS Source: HDB

Customer service agent Sutha Devi, 42, said she is dissatisfied with her \$340,000 compensation, which was a \$30,000 increase from the earlier estimate.

“I’m disappointed because since we are being forced to leave, I expected the amount to at least be higher to compensate us,” said Ms Devi.

She and her husband will be taking up a four-room BTO flat in Lakeside that costs less than the replacement flat.

Administrative assistant Karine Wong, 36, who lives with her parents who are in their 60s, said the \$36,000 increase in actual compensation is helpful, but not enough.

“We’ll just take a three-room replacement unit on a lower floor, as long as we don’t have to fork out more money,” she said.

Housewife Noorjahan Aburahman, 59, said she is quite happy with her compensation, which is almost \$50,000 more than the earlier estimate.

“My husband and I are almost in our 60s, so we will take a three-room flat with a 50-year lease because it is cheaper and will give us some cash, and we will live the rest of our lives there,” she said.

Source: <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/housing/ang-mo-kio-sers-residents-to-get-compensation-from-hdb-that-is-about-75-per-cent-higher-than-estimates>

Ang Mo Kio Sers: Homeowners to get compensation of about 7.5% more than previously estimated

BY [ASYRAF KAMIL](#)

Published **November 9, 2022**

Updated **November 9, 2022**

- **Ang Mo Kio residents selected for the Selective En Bloc Redevelopment Scheme (Sers) in April will receive compensation of about 7.5 per cent more than previously estimated**
- **The flat owners will also receive a payment for “reasonable expense”**
- **This comprises a removal allowance of S\$10,000 and the payment of stamp and legal fees for the purchase of a replacement unit**
- **Eligible flat owners will also receive a Sers grant of up to S\$30,000 for the purchase of a replacement unit**

SINGAPORE — Residents of the four Housing and Development Board (HDB) blocks in Ang Mo Kio who were selected for the Selective En Bloc Redevelopment Scheme (Sers) in April will receive compensation that is about 7.5 per cent higher than the estimates that were previously given to them by the authorities.

In a news release on Wednesday (Nov 9), HDB said that on top of the market value compensation, the flat owners will also receive a payment for “reasonable expense”.

This comprises a removal allowance of S\$10,000 to defray their relocation cost, as well as the payment of stamp and legal fees for the purchase of a replacement unit that is equivalent in value to their Sers flat.

Eligible flat owners will also receive a Sers grant of up to S\$30,000 for the purchase of a replacement unit.

HDB said that its officers went door-to-door on Wednesday to deliver “compensation notices” to residents living in Blocks 562 to 565 at Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3. The compensation for the flat owners is as follows:

Flat Type	Estimated Compensation (Market Value)	Actual Compensation (Market Value)	Reasonable Expenses*	Overall Compensation (Actual Compensation + Reasonable Expenses)
3-room flats (68 sqm)	\$290,000 - \$340,000	\$315,000 - \$370,000	\$14,800 - \$16,000	\$329,800 - \$386,000
3-room flats (82 sqm)	\$340,000 - \$390,000	\$381,000 - \$457,000	\$16,400 - \$18,700	\$397,400 - \$475,700
4-room flats (92/93 sqm)	\$380,000 - \$450,000	\$410,000 - \$479,000	\$17,300 - \$19,400	\$427,300 - \$498,400

Housing and Development Board

HDB said that the four blocks comprise 606 units that are mainly made up of three- and four-rooms flats.

At the time of the Sers announcement in April, these flats — which were completed in 1979 — are about 43 years old and have about 57 years of remaining lease.

By the time these owners move out of their flats, which is estimated to be about end 2027 for those moving to new replacement flats at Ang Mo Kio Drive, the flats would have a balance lease of about 52 years.

FACTORS FOR HIGHER ACTUAL COMPENSATION TO OWNERS

HDB on Wednesday cited two key factors for the higher actual compensation to owners. They are:

1. The conditions and extent of the renovations, fittings and fixtures of each unit after a physical inspection where flats that are well renovated and well maintained command higher value
2. The actual compensations reflecting resale market movements between the time the estimates were prepared in February 2022 and the time of the Sers announcement in April

TODAY had previously reported that some residents of the four public housing blocks were upset that they may need to top up money for a similar-sized replacement flat. In particular, they were worried that many seniors among the 600-odd households there would be unable to afford a replacement flat without downsizing to a smaller unit.

On Wednesday, HDB said that there are a wide range of rehousing options for these Sers flat owners.

Among others, residents may opt for a new flat with a fresh 99-year lease at Ang Mo Kio Drive. HDB pointed out that on top of the payment for reasonable expenses and Sers grant, these new

flats are also priced with a “generous subsidy” that make their prices “considerably lower than comparable resale flats”.

These new replacement flats have an estimated price ranging from S\$292,000 to S\$384,000 for a 65sqm three-room flat. For four-room flats, the estimated price ranges from S\$396,000 to S\$487,000 for an 80sqm unit and S\$438,000 to S\$563,000 for a 90sqm unit.

Registration for the new flats will start in the first quarter of 2023, HDB said.

“The flat owners will be invited to book their new homes from late 2023, during which the actual selling prices of the new flats will be made known,” it said.

HDB also highlighted two new rehousing options for the flat owners:

- A shorter 50-year lease for a three-room or larger flat if the 50-year lease is able to last the youngest flat owner until at least the age of 95
- A lease buyback scheme for seniors for their existing flat and the purchase of a short-lease replacement flat thereafter

“With these available options, and based on the actual (higher) compensations for flats in the four blocks in Ang Mo Kio Avenue 3, almost all (99 per cent) flat owners can purchase a new replacement flat of a similar flat type or size without cash top-up, and enjoy the benefits of moving into a new flat with a lease that can last them till the age of 95 and above,” said HDB.

OTHER REHOUSING OPTIONS AVAILABLE

HDB said that aside from the new flats at the designated replacement site, the Sers flat owners have other rehousing options to choose from.

Among them, they are able to buy a new flat elsewhere in HDB’s Build-to-Order (BTO) and Sale of Balance Flats exercises with the Sers rehousing benefits.

The owners can also buy a flat from HDB’s open booking of flats with the Sers rehousing benefits or a resale flat from the open market.

Huttons Asia’s senior director for research Lee Sze Teck said that with the compensation amount determined, residents will be able to “plan for their replacement flat with more certainty”.

“The upcoming BTO exercise in November will offer about 9,500 flats and there will be another 2,900 to 3,900 BTO flats slated for launch in February 2023,” he said.

“Residents affected will have more than 10,000 BTO flats across many areas to choose from.”

HDB said that when serving the compensation notices to the Sers households, its officers would have also provided a “customised financial plan” to guide the homeowners in choosing a rehousing option that “best meets their needs and budget”.

“HDB will continue to provide personalised support for all Sers households and guide them through the entire Sers process,” it said.

Source: <https://www.todayonline.com/singapore/ang-mo-kio-sers-homeowners-get-compensation-about-75-more-previously-estimated-2041391>

Question 65 for Written Answer in the Order Paper for the 1 August 2022 Sitting

PQ 1993: [https://www.mnd.gov.sg/newsroom/parliament-matters/q-as/view/written-answer-by-ministry-of-national-development-on-waiver-of-resale-levies-on-flats-acquired-under-selective-en-bloc-redevelopment-scheme-\(sers\)-in-the-past-and-possible-exemptions-for-current-and-future-affected-households](https://www.mnd.gov.sg/newsroom/parliament-matters/q-as/view/written-answer-by-ministry-of-national-development-on-waiver-of-resale-levies-on-flats-acquired-under-selective-en-bloc-redevelopment-scheme-(sers)-in-the-past-and-possible-exemptions-for-current-and-future-affected-households)

Written Answer by Ministry of National Development on waiver of resale levies on flats acquired under Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) in the past and possible exemptions for current and future affected households

Aug 1, 2022

Mr Chua Kheng Wee Louis: To ask the Minister for National Development with regard to households whose flats have been acquired under the Selective En bloc Redevelopment Scheme (SERS) and subjected to the resale levy (a) whether HDB has waived such resale levies on a case-by-case basis in the past; and (b) whether HDB will consider granting an exemption to current and future affected households.

Answer:

- 1 Flat owners are typically allowed to purchase subsidised flats only twice, and are required to pay a resale levy before or upon the purchase of their second subsidised flat. This is to ensure a fairer distribution of public housing subsidies between first-time and second-time buyers of subsidised HDB flats.
- 2 Under SERS, households whose SERS flat is a subsidised flat do not need to pay a resale levy when they buy a new subsidised replacement flat from HDB. This waiver of resale levy is a concession under SERS.
- 3 However, the resale levy is payable for SERS households who had previously sold a subsidised flat elsewhere but had not bought a second subsidised flat and paid a resale levy. In such instances, the resale levy is capped at \$30,000 as a concession under SERS.
- 4 In addition, SERS flat owners who are liable for but do not wish to pay the resale levy have other housing options, such as selling their SERS flat with the rehousing benefits on the open market or opting for an ex-gratia payment on top of the market compensation for their SERS flat. They can then buy a resale flat of their choice without the need to pay any levy.

Question 38 for Written Answer in the Order Paper for the 2 August 2022 Sitting

PQ 1991: <https://www.mnd.gov.sg/newsroom/parliament-matters/q-as/view/written-answer-by-ministry-of-national-development-on-factors-determining-the-removal-allowance-for-residents-affected-by-hdb-s-selective-en-bloc-redevelopment-scheme>

Written Answer by Ministry of National Development on factors determining the removal allowance for residents affected by HDB's Selective En-bloc Redevelopment Scheme

Aug 2, 2022

Ms Nadia Ahmad Samdin: To ask the Minister for National Development (a) what factors are taken into consideration in determining the removal allowance for residents affected by HDB's Selective En-bloc Redevelopment Scheme; and (b) whether the current removal allowance of \$10,000 can be re-evaluated given rising cost pressures.

Answer:

1 Under SERS, flat owners are compensated for their existing flats based on the prevailing market values at the time of the SERS announcement. In addition, they receive payment for reasonable expenses, comprising a removal allowance of \$10,000 per flat, and stamp and legal fees for the purchase of a replacement flat that is assumed to be equivalent in value to their SERS flat.

2 Before the announcement of a SERS site, HDB reviews the entire benefits package holistically. In reviewing the removal allowance, we consider factors such as the cost of engaging movers, which is typically between \$300 and \$500 per truck load. To minimise the need for renovations, flat owners can opt in for fittings and fixtures to be installed in their new flat under the Optional Component Scheme (OCS). The cost of the OCS will be incorporated into the flat price, which can be paid via CPF monies and/or the housing loan, thus reducing the cash outlay needed for renovations. We continue to monitor the costs closely and will review the grant as and when needed.

3 The Land Acquisition Act provides for SERS flat owners to appeal to an independent Appeals Board if they have concerns over the reasonableness of the compensation for their SERS flat and/or the payments for reasonable expenses.

Question 38 for Oral Answer in the Order Paper for the 2 August 2022 Sitting

PQ 3198: <https://www.mnd.gov.sg/newsroom/parliament-matters/q-as/view/written-answer-by-ministry-of-national-development-on-grants-and-allowance-under-the-selective-en-bloc-redevelopment-scheme>

Written Answer by Ministry of National Development on grants and allowance under the Selective En Bloc Redevelopment Scheme

Aug 2, 2022

Mr Yip Hon Weng: To ask the Minister for National Development (a) when were the \$30,000 grant under Selective En Bloc Redevelopment Scheme and \$10,000 moving allowance established; (b) how were these figures arrived at; (c) how often are these figures reviewed; and (d) does the Ministry take into account the prevailing economic situation to ensure that the grants and the moving allowance will be in line with the current market expenses at the time when the residents move into their new place.

Answer:

1. Before the announcement of a SERS exercise, HDB reviews the entire benefits package for residents holistically. Including the compensation value of the existing flats and other benefits, residents under SERS will generally be able to afford replacement flats.
2. Under SERS, flat owners are compensated for their existing flats based on the prevailing market values at the time of the SERS announcement. The SERS grant of up to \$30,000 for eligible households provides added financial help for residents to purchase a replacement flat.
3. SERS flat owners can then use their total compensation to decide on a rehousing option that best suits their needs and budget. They may buy a new flat at the designated replacement site at a subsidised price which is also frozen at the point of the SERS announcement date, or a subsidised new flat elsewhere, offered in HDB's public sales exercises.
4. In addition, residents will receive payment for reasonable expenses, comprising a removal allowance and stamp and legal fees for the purchase of a replacement flat. MND does review the removal allowance, taking into account factors such as the cost of engaging movers, which is typically between \$300 and \$500 per truck load. To minimise the need for renovations, SERS flat owners can opt for fittings and fixtures to be installed in their new flat under the Optional Component Scheme (OCS). The cost of the OCS will be incorporated into the flat price, which can be paid via CPF monies and/or housing loan, thus reducing the cash outlay needed for renovations. We continue to monitor the costs closely and will review the grant as and when needed.

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS OF THE COMMITTEE

1st Meeting

Monday, 29 August 2022

3.30 pm

PRESENT

Mr Speaker (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin) (*in the Chair*)

Mr Chee Hong Tat

Mr S Iswaran

Mr Leong Mun Wai

Mr Ong Ye Kung

Ms Rahayu Mahzam

Ms Hany Soh

Mr Edwin Tong Chun Fai

-
1. The Committee deliberated.
 2. The Committee agreed to write to the Ministry of National Development to submit a memorandum on the Petition presented to Parliament on 1 August 2022.

Adjourned to a date to be fixed.

2nd Meeting

Wednesday, 28 September 2022

10.00 am

PRESENT

Mr Speaker (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin) (*in the Chair*)

Mr Chee Hong Tat

Mr Leong Mun Wai

Mr Ong Ye Kung

Ms Rahayu Mahzam

Ms Hany Soh

Mr Edwin Tong Chun Fai

ABSENT

Mr S Iswaran

-
1. The Committee deliberated.
 2. The Committee agreed to write to Ministry of National Development to submit a further memorandum on the Petition presented to Parliament on 1 August 2022.

Adjourned to a date to be fixed.

3rd Meeting

Monday, 31 October 2022

10.00 am

PRESENT

Mr Speaker (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin) (*in the Chair*)

Mr Chee Hong Tat

Mr S Iswaran

Mr Leong Mun Wai

Ms Rahayu Mahzam

Ms Hany Soh

ABSENT

Mr Ong Ye Kung

Mr Edwin Tong Chun Fai

-
1. The Committee deliberated.
 2. The Committee agreed to write to Ministry of National Development to submit another memorandum on the Petition presented to Parliament on 1 August 2022.

Adjourned to a date to be fixed.

4th Meeting

Wednesday, 16 November 2022

10.30 am

PRESENT

Mr Speaker (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin) (*in the Chair*)

Mr Ong Ye Kung

Mr Chee Hong Tat

Mr Leong Mun Wai

Ms Rahayu Mahzam

Ms Hany Soh

ABSENT

Mr S Iswaran

Mr Edwin Tong Chun Fai

1. The Committee deliberated.

Report

2. The Chairman's report brought up and read the first time.
3. Resolved, "That the Chairman's report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph."

Paragraphs 1 to 8 inclusive read and agreed to.

4. Resolved, "That this report be the Report of the Committee to Parliament."
5. Agreed that the Chairman do present the Report to Parliament.

Adjourned sine die.
